SURFACTANTS AND INTERFACIAL PHENOMENA

MILTON J. ROSEN

Surfactants and Interfacial Phenomena

Milton J. Rosen

Professor of Chemistry Brooklyn College of the City University of New York

A Wiley-Interscience Publication

New York · Chichester · JOHN WILEY & SONS · Brisbane · Toronto

Copyright © 1978 by John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

All rights reserved. Published simultaneously in Canada.

Reproduction or translation of any part of this work beyond that permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the 1976 United States Copyright Act without the permission of the copyright owner is unlawful. Requests for permission or further information should be addressed to the Permissions Department, John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data Rosen, Milton J.

Surfactants and interfacial phenomena.

"A Wiley-Interscience publication." Includes bibliographies and index.

Surface active agents.
 Surface chemistry.

TP994.R67 668'.1 77-19092 ISBN 0-471-73600-7

Printed in the United States of America 10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 suggested by the existence of persistent foam in cases where the film is known not to have great surface viscosity—and this is true of foaming solutions of purified surface-active agents, where it is known that the surface films are not particularly coherent. In these cases, it has been suggested that when the film becomes very thin ($<0.2~\mu\mathrm{m}$ or 200 nm), stability is obtained chiefly because of the electrical repulsion between the ionic double layers associated with the adsorbed ionic surfactant on the two sides of the liquid film. Since the addition of electrolyte to the foaming solution causes compression of the electrical double layers associated with the surface films, such addition decreases their mutual repulsion. This is believed to account for the decreased thickness of liquid films with increase in their electrolyte content (Davies, 1963) and for the decreased stability of many foams on the addition of electrolyte.

III. THE RELATIONSHIP OF SURFACTANT CHEMICAL STRUCTURE TO FOAMING IN AQUEOUS SOLUTION

《中心》的"我们的是一个是一个人的"一个人"的"一个人"的"我们是一个人",我们是一个人,我们可以是一个人,我们就是一个人,我们可以是一个人

In foaming as in other surface properties, correlations between surfactant structure and foaming in aqueous solution require a distinction between the efficiency of the surfactant, its bulk phase concentration required to produce a significant amount of foam, and its effectiveness, the maximum foam height obtained with the surfactant solution regardless of its concentration. Distinction must also be made between foam production, measured by the height of the foam initially produced, and foam stability, the height after a given amount of time. Therefore in comparing the foaming properties of different surfactants, the term foaming ability must be clearly defined. In addition, such conditions as the method used to produce the foam, the temperature of the solution, the hardness of the water used, and its electrolyte content must all be specified. Since most of the foaming data on surfactants with clearly defined structures have been obtained by use of the Ross-Miles method (Ross, 1953), the structural correlations discussed here are based mainly on data obtained by what method.

In the Ross-Miles method, 200 ml of a solution of surfactant contained in a pipette of specified dimensions with a 2.9 mm I.D. orifice are allowed to fall 90 cm onto 50 ml of the same solution contained in a cylindrical vessel maintained at a given temperature (often 60°C) by means of a water jacket. The height of the foam produced in the cylindrical vessel is read immediately after all the

solution has run out of the pipette ("initial foam height") and then again after a given amount of time (generally, 5 minutes).

A. Efficiency as a Foaming Agent

the surfactant as a foamer. Those structural factors that produce a hood of the CMC is reached, in which region foam height reaches a maximum. Thus the CMC of a surfactant is a good measure of its efficiency as a foaming agent; the lower the CMC, the more efficient Foam height generally increases with increase in surfactant concentration below the critical micelle concentration until the neighborlower critical micelle concentration - for example, increased length of the hydrophobic group — would therefore be expected to increase the efficiency of the surfactant as a foaming agent. The addition of neutral electrolyte (which decreases the CMC of the surfactant) increases the efficiency of ionic surfactants. Table 7-1 lists the bulk phase concentrations at which foam height reaches a maximum for some aqueous solutions of surfactants, together with their CMCs at the same temperature at which the foaming data were obtained. It is apparent that surfactants with longer hydrophobic groups are more efficient, but not necessarily more effective, foaming agents. Since the Ross-Miles foaming test is usually done at 0.25% surfactant only those materials having CMCs greater than that will not have concentration, equivalent to about $8 \times 10^{-3} M$ for most surfactants, reached their maximum foam volume at that concentration.

B. Effectiveness as a Foaming Agent

The effectiveness of a surfactant as a foaming agent appears to depend on both its effectiveness in reducing the surface tension of the foaming solution and on the magnitude of its intermolecular cohesive forces. The volume of foam produced when a given amount of work is done on an aqueous solution of surfactant to create foam depends on the surface tension of the solution, since the minimum amount of work required to produce the foam is $\gamma \cdot \Delta A$, the product of the surface tension and the change in the area of the liquid/gas interface as a result of the foaming. The lower the surface tension of the aqueous solution, the greater appears to be the volume of foam of the same average bubble size produced by a given amount of work under the same foaming conditions (Rosen, 1969). It has also been

	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		Concentration (M) to reach maximum	(D ₀) amon	Surfactant
Reference	Height (mm)	СМС	ingian meol	Temp. (°C)	
Gray, 1955	165	16×10^{-3}	13 × 10-3	09	p-C ₈ H ₁₇ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ⁻ Na ⁺
Gray, 1965	182	3 × 10_3	4.5 × 10 ⁻³	09	p-C ₁₀ H ₂₁ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ -Na ⁺
Gray, 1955	202	3×10^{-3}	€_01×₽	09	o-C ₁₂ H ₂₆ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ⁻ Na ⁺
Gray, 1955	200	1.2×10^{-3}	€_01 × ₽	09	p-C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ⁻ Na ⁺
Gray, 1965	1 62	_	8×10^{-3}	09	o-C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ -Na ⁺
Gray, 1955	512	2 × 10_3	8 × 10 ⁻³	09	P-C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ -N ₃ +
Gray, 1955	230	4 × 10_3	2 × 10-3	09	P-C ₇ H ₁₆ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ⁺
Dreger, 194.	130	83×10^{-3}	10×10^{-3}	09	C ₆ H ₁₁ CH(C ₅ H ₁₁)SO ₄ ¬Na ⁺
Rosen, 1969	210	13 × 10-3	11 × 10 ⁻³	09	C ₁₂ H ₂₅ SO ₃ ⁻ Na ⁺
Dreger, 194.	502	ε-01 × 6	5 × 10 ⁻³	97	Clash Cover Nation 120 - 121
Dreger, 194	502	6.5×10^{-3}	2 × 10-3	9₹	C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)SO ₄ =N ₃ +
Dreger, 194	220	ε_01 × 61	>12 × 10_3	97	CeH ₁₃ CH(CeH ₁₃)SO ₄ -Na ⁺
8981 ,nssoA	212	3×10^{-3}	3 × 10 ⁻³	09	C14H29SO3_K+
Dreger, 194	552	2.3×10^{-3}	3 × 10_3	97	+ _B N ⁻ _p OS _{es} H _{p1} C
Dreger, 1944	220	1.7 × 10°3	3 × 10_3	97	$C_{13}H_{27}CH(CH_3)SO_4^{-1}M_5^{-1}$
Dreger, 1944	540	6.7×10^{-3}	2 × 10-3	97	C1H15CH(C1H15)SO4TN3+
Rosen, 1969	233	$^{6}-01 \times 9.0$	6.8 × 10 ³	09	C16H33SO3_K+
Rosen, 1969	220	$^{6}-01 \times 7.0$	$^{6}-01 \times 8.0$	09	1 ₆ H ₃₃ SO ₄ -Na ⁺
Dreger, 1944	212	6 -01 × 3.0	<1 × 10-3	9₺	C16H31CH(CH3)SO4_Na+
Dreger, 1944	542	2.3×10^{-3}	⁶ −01 × ⁴	97	3 H $_{17}$ CH(8 H $_{17}$)SO $_{4}$ T 8
Gray, 1965	190	_	13 × 10-3	09	$C_9H_{19}CH(CH_3)C_6H_4SO_3^-N_8^+$
Gray, 1965	94 T	_	^E -01 × 4 E01 × 7.0	· 09 09	-C ₁₂ H ₂₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ _N ₈ + -C ₁₂ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ _N ₈ +

211

The Relationship of Surfactant Chemical Structure to Foaming in Aqueous Solution

suggested (Dreger, 1944) that the rate of attainment of surface tension reduction may also be a factor in determining the effectiveness of a surfactant as a foaming agent. Therefore branched-chain surfactants and those containing centrally located hydrophobic groups, which are believed to diffuse rapidly to the interface, would be expected to produce higher volumes of initial foam. However, not only must the surfactant produce the foam, it must also maintain interfacial film with sufficient cohesion to impart elasticity and mechanical strength to the liquid lamellae enclosing the gas in the foam. Since interchain cohesion increases with increase in the length of the hydrophobic group, this may account for the observation that foam height often goes through a maximum with increase in the length of the chain. Too short a chain probably produces insufficient cohesiveness, whereas too great a length produces too much rigidity t-the foam must have appreciable stability. This should require an for good film elasticity (or too low a solubility in water).

terminal to a more central position in the molecule, foam heights This is necessary here because the shift of the hydrophilic group to a hand, generally show lower foam heights than isomeric straight-chain. hydrophilic group of a straight-chain surfactant is moved from a water solubility for good foaming (e.g., >16 carbon atoms at 40°C). Presumably for a similar reason, 2,5-di-n-alkylbenzenesulfonates stability. The result of these two opposing factors is that when the generally increase, provided that the materials are all compared above hydrophilic groups can depress the surface tension of water to lower values than isomeric straight-chain compounds or those with terminally located hydrophilic groups (Chapter 5, Section II), the former types of compounds would be expected to show higher initial foam heights than the latter. However, since hydrophobic groups with branches have weaker intermolecular cohesive forces than straightchain ones, the former would be expected to show less foam their critical micelle concentrations where foaming is at a maximum. more central position in the molecule causes an increase in the CMC of the surfactant with a resulting decrease in its efficiency as a foaming agent. Surfactants with highly branched chains, on the other materials, except where the length of the hydrophobic group becomes too long for straight-chain compounds to have adequate show lower foam heights and stabilities than the corresponding hydrophobic groups show greater water solubility than straight-chain Since branched-chain surfactants and those with centrally located p-n-alkylbenzenesulfonates (Kolbel, 1960b). Since branched-chain ones and intermolecular cohesive forces increase with increase in

chain surfactants containing up to 20 carbon atoms and foam heights in the $C_{2\,0}$ branched compounds appear to exceed those obtained with chain length, good foaming at 40°C can be obtained with branchedany shorter straight-chain compounds (Kölbel, 1960a).

showing greater initial foam heights and foam stabilities. Thus in the dodecyl sulfate series, the effectiveness decreases with increased size In ionic surfactants the effectiveness of foaming appears to depend also on the nature of the counterion, those with smaller counterions of the counterion in the order $\mathrm{NH_4}^+ > (\mathrm{CH_3})_4 \mathrm{N}^+ > (\mathrm{C_2H_5})_4 \mathrm{N}^+$ $> (C_4 H_9)_4 N^+$ (Kondo, 1960).

Table 7-2 lists the foaming effectiveness of some surfactants in aqueous solution.

Since interchain cohesion must overcome thermal agitation of the molecules, which increases with increase in temperature, it is to be temperature. The disodium salts of \alpha-sulfocarboxylic acids produce In distilled water at room temperature, sodium alkyl sulfates and soaps with saturated, straight-chain hydrophobic groups containing 12-14 carbon atoms seem to show the best foaming capacities (Broich, 1966); at higher temperatures, homologous materials with somewhat longer chains give optimum foaming. Thus at 60°C, saturated straight-chain alkyl sulfates containing 16 carbon atoms, palmitate soaps, dodecyl- and tetradecylbenzenesulfonates (hydrophobic groups equivalent to 15.5-17.5 carbon chains), and α -sulfoesters containing 16-17 carbon atoms show maximum foaming power (Weil, 1954, 1966; Gray, 1955; Kölbel, 1959; Micich, 1966; Stirton, 1962). Near the boiling point, C₁₈ compounds are best. expected that optimum chain lengths should increase with increase in much less foam than the monosodium salts of α -sulfoesters, presumably because increased electrostatic repulsion between hydrophilic groups counters inter-chain cohesive forces.

In hard water somewhat shorter anionic compounds seem to give optimum foaming, probably because of the greater cohesiveness of anionic surface films in the presence of Ca++. Thus in 300 ppm CaCO₃ solution at 60°C, C₁₂—C₁₄ saturated straight-chain alkyl sulfates show the highest foaming capacities (Weil, 1954).

reach a maximum at a particular oxyethylene chain length and then decrease (Schick, 1963). This is ascribed to a maximum in are probably due to the larger surface area per molecule and the oxyethylenated nonionics both foam stability and foam volume Nonionic surfactants generally produce less foam and much less stable foam than ionic surfactants in aqueous media. These effects absence of highly charged surface films in these foams. In poly-

Table 7-2. Foaming Effectiveness of Aqueous Surfactant Solutions (Ross-Miles Method^a)

			Foam Height (mm)			
			Disti	lled Water	300 ppm CaCC)3
Surfactant	Conc. (%)	Temp. (°C)	Initial	After Time (min)	Initial	Reference
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ OSO ₃ ⁻ Na ⁺	0.25	60	220	175(5)	240 ^b	Weil, 1966, 195
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺	0.25	60	_	205(1)		Rosen, 1969
C ₁₄ H ₂₉ OSO ₃ ¬Na ⁺	0.25	60	231	184(5)	246^b	Weil, 1954
C ₁₄ H ₂₉ SO ₃ ⁻ Na ⁺	0.11	60	_	214(1)	_	Rosen, 1969
C ₁₆ H ₃₃ OSO ₃ ¬Na ⁺	0.25	60	245	240(5)	178^{b}	Weil, 1966, 195
C ₁₆ H ₃₃ SO ₃ ⁻ K ⁺	0.033	60	_	233(1)	_	Rosen, 1969
C ₁₈ H ₃₇ OSO ₃ ⁻ Na ⁺	0.25	60	227	227(5)	151 ^b	Weil, 1954
Sodium oleyl sulfate	0.25	60	246	240(5)	226 ^b	Weil, 1954
Sodium elaidyl sulfate	0.25	60	243	241(5)	202^{b}	Weil, 1954
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ OCH ₂ CH(CH ₃)OSO ₃ ⁻ Na ⁺	0.25	60	200	_	_	Weil, 1966
C ₁₄ H ₂₉ OCH ₂ CH(CH ₃)OSO ₃ -Na ⁺	0.25	60	215	_	_	Weil, 1966
$C_{14}H_{29}[OCH_2CH(CH_3)]_2OSO_3^-Na^+$	0.25	60	210	_	_	Weil, 1966
C ₁₆ H ₃₃ OCH ₂ CH(CH ₃)OSO ₃ ⁻ Na ⁺	0.25	60	200	_	_	Weil, 1966
C ₁₈ H ₃₇ OCH ₂ CH(CH ₃)OSO ₃ ⁻ Na ⁺	0.25	60	160	_	_	Weil, 1966
C ₁₈ H ₃₇ OCH ₂ CH ₂ OSO ₃ ⁻ Na ⁺	0.25	60	160	_		Weil, 1966
O-C ₈ H ₁₇ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ⁻ Na ⁺	0.15	60	148	_		Gray, 1965
o-C ₈ H ₂₇ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ⁻ Na ⁺	0.15	60	134			Gray, 1965
$P-C_8H_{17}C_6H_4SO_3^-Na^+$	0.25	60	150		_	Gray, 1955
$O-C_9H_{19}CH(CH_3)C_6H_4SO_3$ Na ⁺	0.15	60	165	_	_	Gray, 1965
$-C_9H_{19}CH(CH_3)C_6H_4SO_3^-Na^+$	0.15	60	162	_	_	Gray, 1965
						ニー・コング 関い望さずる だっかん みー
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ -Na ⁺	0.15	60	206	- -		Gray, 1965
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ⁻ Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ⁻ Na ⁺	0.25	60	208			Gray, 1955
$C_{12}H_{25}C_{6}H_{4}SO_{3}^{-}Na^{+}$ $C_{12}H_{25}C_{6}H_{4}SO_{3}^{-}Na^{+}$ $C_{12}H_{25}C_{6}H_{4}SO_{3}^{-}Na^{+}$	0.25 0.15	60 60				Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965
$C_{12}H_{25}C_6H_4SO_3^-Na^+$ $C_{12}H_{25}C_6H_4SO_3^-Na^+$ $C_{12}H_{25}C_6H_4SO_3^-Na^+$ $I_{10}H_{21}CH(CH_3)C_6H_4SO_3^-Na^+$	0.25 0.15 0.25	60 60 60	208 201		 245	Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966
$C_{12}H_{25}C_6H_4SO_3^-Na^+$ $C_{12}H_{25}C_6H_4SO_3^-Na^+$ $C_{12}H_{25}C_6H_4SO_3^-Na^+$ $I_{10}H_{21}CH(CH_3)C_6H_4SO_3^-Na^+$ $C_{11}H_{23}CH(CH_3)C_6H_4SO_3^-Na^+$	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15	60 60 60 60	208 201 — 190		 245	Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₂ H ₂₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.15	60 60 60 60	208 201 — 190 210			Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 10H ₂₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.15 0.25	60 60 60 60 60 60	208 201 			Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 10H ₂₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.15 0.25 0.15	60 60 60 60 60 60	208 201 			Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.15 0.25 0.15	60 60 60 60 60 60 60	208 201 		_ _ _	Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₀ H ₂₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60	208 201 — 190 210 218 219 230		 80	Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966
Ci ₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -1 ₀ H ₂₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -1 ₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -1 ₄ H ₂₉ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60	208 201 — 190 210 218 219 230 — —		_ _ _	Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 10H ₂₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₁₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₁₄ H ₂₉ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60	208 201 — 190 210 218 219 230 — — 105		- - - - 80 10	Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 10H ₂₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 12H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 12H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.15	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60	208 201 — 190 210 218 219 230 — 105 129		 80 10 	Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₁₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₁₄ H ₂₉ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60	208 201 — 190 210 218 219 230 — — 105		- - - - 80 10	Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -1 ₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -1 ₄ H ₂₉ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₆ H ₃₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₆ H ₃₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₆ H ₃₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₆ H ₃₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₆ H ₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₆ H ₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₆ H ₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₆ H ₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ C ₆	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.15 0.25	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60	208 201 — 190 210 218 219 230 — 105 129 — 220		 80 10 - 0	Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Stirton, 1962
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -1 ₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -1 ₄ H ₂₉ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₅ H	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60	208 201 — 190 210 218 219 230 — — 105 129 — 220 200		 80 10 0 240 225	Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Stirton, 1962 Stirton, 1962
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₄ H ₂₉ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ +C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ CH(C	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60	208 201 — 190 210 218 219 230 — 105 129 — 220 200		0 240 225 185	Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Stirton, 1962 Stirton, 1962 Weil, 1960
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₁₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₁₄ H ₂₉ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₁₆ H ₃₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ H ₃ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁₂ H ₂₅ T ₁₁₅ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁₂ H ₂₅ T ₁₁₅ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₄ H ₉	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60	208 201 —		0 240 225 185 230	Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Stirton, 1962 Stirton, 1962 Weil, 1960 Stirton, 1962
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₁₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₁₄ H ₂₉ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₁₆ H ₃₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₁₆ H ₃₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ H ₃ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁₂ H ₂₅ T ₁₁₅ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁₂ H ₂₅ T ₁₁₅ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₄ H ₉ 1 ₁₀ H ₂₁ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₆ H ₁ 1 ₁₀ H ₂₁ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₅ H ₁₁	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60	208 201 		0 240 225 185 230 235	Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Stirton, 1962 Stirton, 1962 Weil, 1960 Stirton, 1962 Stirton, 1962 Stirton, 1962
C12H25C6H4SO3Na+ C12H25C6H4SO3Na+ C12H25C6H4SO3Na+ C12H25C6H4SO3Na+ C12H25C6H4SO3Na+ C11H23CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C11H23CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C11H23CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C11H23CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C7H15CH(C4H9)C6H4SO3Na+ C7H15CH(C4H9)C6H4SO3Na+ C7H15CH(C4H9)C6H4SO3Na+ C12H25CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C15H31CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C15H31CH(SO3Na+)COOC12H25 C16H3CH(SO3Na+)COOC14H29 C16CH(SO3Na+)COOC4H9 C10H21CH(SO3Na+)COOC6H11 C10H21CH(SO3Na+)COOC6H11 C10H21CH(SO3Na+)COOC6H11 C10H21CH(SO3Na+)COOC6H11	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 6	208 201			Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Stirton, 1962
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₆ H ₃₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₆ H ₃₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ 1 ₇ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁₂ H ₂₅ 7 ₇ H ₁₅ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁₂ H ₂₅ 7 ₇ H ₁₅ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₈ H ₁₇ 1 ₁₀ H ₂₁ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₈ H ₁₇ 1 ₁₀ H ₂₁ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₅ H ₁₁ 1 ₁₄ H ₂₉ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₅ H ₁₁ 1 ₁₄ H ₂₉ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 6	208 201	- - 200(5) 165(5)	0 240 225 185 230 235 225 125	Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Stirton, 1962 Meich, 1966
C12H25C6H4SO3Na+ C12H25C6H4SO3Na+ C12H25C6H4SO3Na+ C12H25C6H4SO3Na+ C12H25C6H4SO3Na+ C11H23CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C11H23CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C11H23CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C11H23CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C7H15CH(C4H9)C6H4SO3Na+ C7H15CH(C4H9)C6H4SO3Na+ C7H15CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C11H23CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C11H25CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C15H31CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C15H31CH(CH3)C6H4S	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 6	208 201	 200(5) 165(5)		Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Stirton, 1962 Stirton, 1966 Stirton, 1966 Stirton, 1966 Stirton, 1966 Stirton, 1966
C12H25C6H4SO3Na+ C12H25C6H4SO3Na+ C12H25C6H4SO3Na+ C12H25C6H4SO3Na+ C12H25C6H4SO3Na+ C11H23CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C11H23CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C11H23CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C11H23CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C11H23CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C7H15CH(C4H9)C6H4SO3Na+ C7H15CH(C4H9)C6H4SO3Na+ 12H25CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ 12H25CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C15H31CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C15H31CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C15H31CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ C15H31CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ 16H33CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ 16H33CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ 116H33CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ 116H31CH(CH3)C6H4SO3Na+ 116H21CH(SO3Na+)COOC4H9 116H21CH(SO3Na+)COOC4H9 116H21CH(SO3Na+)COOCH3 114H29CH(SO3Na+)COOCH3 114H29CH(SO3Na+)COOCH3 114H29CH(SO3Na+)COOCH3 114H29CH(SO3Na+)COOCH3	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 6	208 201	 200(5) 165(5) 160(5)	0 240 225 185 230 235 225 125 215 200	Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Stirton, 1962 Stirton, 1966 Stirton, 1966 Stirton, 1966 Stirton, 1966
Ci ₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₂ H ₂ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₂ H ₂ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₅ H ₃₁ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁ H ₂₉ cl ₄ H ₅ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁ H ₂₉ cl ₄ H ₅ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₈ H ₁₇ cl ₁ H ₁ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₈ H ₁₇ cl ₁ H ₁ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₆ H ₁₁ cl ₄ H ₂₉ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₆ H ₁₁ cl ₄ H ₂₉ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁ H ₂ cl ₄ H ₂₉ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁ CH ₃ cl ₄ H ₂₉ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₂ H ₅ cl ₄ H ₃ GC(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ cl ₆ H ₃ GC(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ cl ₆ H ₃ GC(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ cl ₆ H ₃ GC(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.2	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 6	208 201			Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Stirton, 1962 Stirton, 1966 Stirton, 1966 Micich, 1966 Micich, 1966
Ci ₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁₆ H ₃₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁₆ H ₃₃ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁₂ H ₂₅ Cl ₁₇ H ₁₅ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁₂ H ₂₅ Cl ₁₇ H ₁₅ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₄ H ₉ Cl ₁₀ H ₂₁ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₅ H ₁₁ Cl ₁₄ H ₂₉ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₅ H ₁₁ Cl ₁₄ H ₂₉ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁ CH ₃ Cl ₁₄ H ₂₉ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁ CH ₃ Cl ₁₄ H ₂₉ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁ CH ₃ Cl ₁₄ H ₂₉ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁ CH ₃ Cl ₁₄ H ₂₉ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁ CH ₃ Cl ₁₄ H ₁₂ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁₆ H ₃₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.2	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 6	208 201	 200(5) 165(5) 160(5)		Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Stirton, 1962 Micich, 1966 Stirton, 1966 Stirton, 1966
Ci ₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₄)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₁ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₆ H ₃₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ Cl ₆ H ₃ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁ H ₂₉ Cl ₁ H ₂ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₂ H ₅ Cl ₁ H ₁ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₄ H ₉ Cl ₁ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₄ H ₉ Cl ₁ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₄ H ₉ Cl ₁ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₄ CH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₄ CH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₄ CH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁ CH ₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₁ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₂ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ Cl ₃ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.2	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 6	208 201			Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Stirton, 1962 Stirton, 1966 Stirton, 1966 Micich, 1966 Micich, 1966
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₆ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₆ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₆ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₆ H ₃₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₆ H ₃₃ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₁₁ H ₁₅ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₁₁ H ₁₅ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₄ H ₉ C ₁₀ H ₂₁ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₆ H ₁₁ C ₁₁ H ₂₉ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₆ H ₁₁ C ₁₁ H ₂₉ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁₂ H ₅ C ₁₃ H ₂₇ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁₃ C ₁₄ H ₂₉ CH(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁₃ C ₁₅ H ₃₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOC ₁₃ C ₁₆ H ₃₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₃₃ C(CH ₃)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₃₇ C(C ₈ H ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₃₇ C(C ₈ H ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₃₇ C(C ₈ H ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₁₇ C(C ₈ H ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₁₇ C(C ₈ H ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₁₇ C(C ₈ H ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₁₇ C(C ₈ H ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₁₇ C(C ₈ H ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₁₇ C(C ₈ H ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₁₇ C(C ₈ H ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₁₇ C(C ₈ H ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₁₇ C(C ₈ H ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₁₇ C(C ₈ H ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₁₇ C(C ₈ H ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₆ H ₁₇ C(C ₈ H ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₇ C(C ₁₇ C(C ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₇ C(C ₁₇ C(C ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₇ C(C ₁₇ C(C ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₇ C(C ₁₇ C(C ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₇ C(C ₁₇ C(C ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁₇ C(C ₁₇ C(C ₁₇)(SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺)COOCH ₃ C ₁	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.2	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 6	208 201			Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Stirton, 1962 Stirton, 1966 Stirton, 1966 Micich, 1966 Micich, 1966 Micich, 1966
C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₂ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₅ C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₁ H ₂₃ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(C ₄ H ₉)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₇ H ₁₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -1 ₂ H ₂₅ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -1 ₄ H ₂₉ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₅ H ₃₁ CH(CH ₃)C ₆ H ₄ SO ₃ ¬Na ⁺ -C ₁₅ H	0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.15 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.25 0.2	60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 60 6	208 201			Gray, 1955 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Gray, 1955 Smith, 1966 Smith, 1966 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Gray, 1965 Smith, 1966 Stirton, 1962 Stirton, 1966 Stirton, 1966 Micich, 1966 Micich, 1966 Micich, 1966 Micich, 1966 Micich, 1966

After Time (min)	Initial	Ref
illed Water	300 ppm CaCO	3
_	• •	

Foam Height (mm)

			Distilled Water		300 ppm CaCO3	
Surfactant	Conc. (%)	Temp. (°C)	Initial	After Time (min)	Initial	Reference
$C_{12}H_{25}O(C_2H_4O)_{15}H$	0.25	60	-		197	Wrigley 1957
$C_{12}H_{25}O(C_2H_4O)_{20}H$	0.25	60				
$C_{12}H_{25}O(C_2H_4O)_{33}H$	0.25	60	_		195	Wrigley, 1957
$C_{16}H_{33}O(C_2H_4O)_{15}H$	0.25	60	_	_	180	Wrigley, 1957
$C_{16}H_{33}O(C_2H_4O)_{20}H$	0.25	60	_	_	153	Wrigley, 1957
$C_{16}H_{33}O(C_2H_4O)_{30}H$	0.25	60			167	Wrigley, 1957
$C_{18}H_{37}O(C_2H_4O)_{15}H$	0.25	60	_		149	Wrigley, 1957
$C_{18}H_{37}O(C_2H_4O)_{21}H$	0.25	60		_	165	Wrigley, 1957
$C_{18}H_{37}O(C_2H_4O)_{30}H$	0.25	60	_		152	Wrigley, 1957
$C_{18}H_{35}O(C_{2}H_{4}O)_{15}H^{c}$	0.25	60	_		115	Wrigley, 1957
C ₁₈ H ₃₅ O(C ₂ H ₄ O) ₂₀ H ^c	0.25		_	_	140	Wrigley, 1957
C ₁₈ H ₃₅ O(C ₂ H ₄ O) ₃₁ H ^c		60	_	_	160	Wrigley, 1957
t-C ₉ H ₁₉ C ₆ H ₄ O(C ₂ H ₄ O) ₈ H	0.25	60			140	Wrigley, 1957
t-C ₉ H ₁₉ C ₆ H ₄ O(C ₂ H ₄ O) ₉ H	0.10	25	55	45(5)	-	GAF, 1965
t-C ₉ H ₁₉ C ₆ H ₄ O(C ₂ H ₄ O ₁₀₋₁₁ H	0.10	25	80	60(5) [*]	_	GAF, 1965
tC H C H O(C H O)	0.10	25	110	80(5)	_	GAF, 1965
t-C ₉ H ₁₉ C ₆ H ₄ O(C ₂ H ₃ O) ₁₃ H	0.10	25	130	110(5)	_	GAF, 1965
t-C ₉ H ₁₉ C ₆ H ₄ O(C ₁ H ₄ O) ₂₀ H	0.10	25 -	120 .	110(5)	-	GAF, 1965
t-C ₂₃ H ₂₅ S(C ₂ H ₄ O) ₉₋₁₀ H	0.30	43	215	35(10)	220^d	Pennsalt, 1956

^aJ. Ross and G. D. Miles, Am. Soc. Testing Materials, Method D1173-53, Philadelphia, Pa., 1953; Oil and Soap 18, 99 (1941). ^b0.11 in 100 ppm CaCO₃.

show higher initial foam heights but lower foam stabilities than

about 13 moles of ethylene oxide per mole of hydrophobe (GAF)

25°C the optimum oxyethylene content for nonylphenol derivates

1965). Homogeneous (single specie) polyoxyethylenated materials

oxide per mole of hydrophobe (Wrigley, 1957). In distilled water at

oxyethylene content in these cases is at 15-20 moles of ethylene

alcohol derivatives. Optimum

heights for polyoxy-

ethylenated n-dodecanol are higher than those for corresponding

hexadecanol, octadecanol, or oleyl

appear to be considerably better foaming agents than polyoxy.

fatty acids. Immediate foam

maximum as the oxyethylene content of the molecule is increased and hydrogen bonding cohesive forces consequently passes through a

increasing oxyethylene content. The summation of the van der Waals hydrogen bonding are stated to pass through a maximum with phase and the cohesive forces due to intra- and intermolecular area per molecule at the surface increases with this change. However

the polyoxyethylene chain is believed to be coiled in the aqueous

ethylene content increases. Van der Waals forces between surfactant

intermolecular cohesive forces in the adsorbed film as

In 300 ppm $CaCO_3$ solution at $60^{\circ}C$, polyoxyethylenated alcohols

of this modification of structure. the liquid lamellae in the forming foam (Dupre, 1960). in bubble formation might be much slower than from the smaller, more highly hydrated micelles, thus decreasing the stabilization of commercial materials of the same nominal structure (Crook, 1964) from these aggregated micelles to the newly created interface involved micelles into larger aggregates. Diffusion of surfactant molecules the cloud point being marked by the aggregation of the dehydrated or above their cloud points. This has been atributed to a rate effect, The foam of polyoxyethylenated nonionics decreases markedly at

approximate those of conventional polyoxyethylenated nonionics of the type RO(CH₂CH₂O)_x H, believed to be due, at least in part, to this low coherent surface film molecule at the end away from the have been produced by adding a second hydrophobic group to the indicate a much more expanded, less coherent surface film as a result Measurements of the surface area per molecule in these products Low-foaming surfactants of the polyoxyethylenated nonionic type). Foams with very poor stability are also obtained the foam produced by the acetal The low-foaming properties first hydrophobic group. with

^cFrom oleyl alcohol.

¹⁵⁰ ppm hard water.

surfactants decreases to a very small volume in a few minutes (Kuwamura, 1972). Placing methyl groups at the ends of the polyoxyethylene chains away from the hydrophobic group, in these cases, too, produces even lower foam volumes and foam stabilities, together with larger surface areas per molecule (Takahashi, 1973).

IV. FOAM STABILIZING ORGANIC ADDITIVES

The foaming properties of surfactant solutions can be modifed greatly by the presence or addition of other organic materials. Solutions that show excellent foaming properties can be converted to low- or nonfoaming materials and those that show poor foaming properties can be converted to high-foaming products by the addition of small amounts of the proper additive. Because of its practical importance, this method of modifying foaming properties has been extensively used and investigated.

Additives that increase the rate of attainment of surface tension equilibrium act as foam inhibitors by decreasing film elasticity while those that decrease the rate of attainment of that equilibrium act as foam stabilizers. Additives that decrease the rate of attainment of surface tension equilibrium may do so by decreasing the critical micelle concentration of the surfactant solution, thereby lowering the activity of the monomeric surfactant in solution and its rate of migration to the surface. On the other hand, additives that cause the breakdown of micelles, with the consequent increase in the activity of the monomeric surfactant, increase the rate of attainment of surface tension equilibrium and decrease foaming (Ross, 1958). Another mechanism by means of which additives can act as foam stabilizers is by increasing the mechanical strength of foam films. The surface films produced by solutions of highly purified surfactants are often weakly coherent films, containing molecules that are relatively widely spaced because of the mutual repulsion of the oriented polar heads. These films are mechanically weak and nonviscous. When they constitute the interfacial film in the lamellae of a foam, liquid drains rapidly from the lamellae. The addition of the proper additive to this type of film can convert it to a closer-packed, more coherent one of high surface viscosity, which is slow-draining and produces a much more stable foam.

The most effective additives for increasing the stability of the foam produced by surfactant solutions appear to be long-chain, often water-insoluble, polar compounds with straight-chain hydrocarbon groups of approximately the same length as the hydrophobic group